WTEC Panel Report on

**CONVERGENCE OF KNOWLEDGE, TECHNOLOGY, AND SOCIETY:**

*Beyond Convergence of Nano-Bio-Info-Cognitive Technologies*

July 2013

*Editors*

Mihail C. Roco
William S. Bainbridge
Bruce Tonn
George Whitesides
Citation: M.C. Roco, W.S. Bainbridge, B. Tonn, and G. Whitesides, eds. 2013. Converging knowledge, technology, and society: Beyond convergence of nano-bio-info-cognitive technologies. Dordrecht, Heidelberg, New York, London: Springer. (The WTEC report is available on the website http://www.wtec.org/NBIC2; the convergence interviews are available on the website http://www.wilsoncenter.org/convergence.)

Cover page: Using the image of a conductor, the CTKS logo on the cover page suggests coordination through societal governance of the essential knowledge and technology platforms (foundational tools, human-scale and Earth-scale platforms) to realize a vision of their convergence to benefit society (people living on the Earth).

The U.S. Federal agencies that sponsored the study are the National Science Foundation (NSF), National Institutes of Health (NIH), National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA), Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Office of Naval Research (ONR), and United States Department of Agriculture (USDA).

Copyright 2013 by WTEC. The U.S. Government retains a nonexclusive and nontransferable license to exercise all exclusive rights provided by copyright. This document is sponsored by the National Science Foundation (NSF) under a cooperative agreement from NSF (ENG-0844639) to the World Technology Evaluation Center, Inc. The first and second co-editors were supported by the NSF Directorate for Engineering and Directorate for Computer and Information Science and Engineering, respectively. The Government has certain rights in this material. Any writings, opinions, findings, and conclusions expressed in this material are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Government, the authors’ parent institutions, or WTEC. This document is available at http://www.wtec.org/NBIC2. Selected interviews with experts on convergence are posted at http://www.wilsoncenter.org/convergence. A list of available WTEC reports is on the inside back cover of this report.
WTEC Study on

Convergence of Knowledge, Technology, and Society:

Beyond Convergence of Nano-Bio-Info-Cognitive Technologies

July 2013

Editors
Mihail C. Roco
William S. Bainbridge
Bruce Tonn
George Whitesides

STUDY TEAM AND REPORT AUTHORS

STUDY COORDINATORS

Mihail C. Roco, PhD
Senior Advisor for Nanotechnology
National Science Foundation
4201 Wilson Boulevard
Arlington, VA 22230

William S. Bainbridge, PhD
Division of Information and Intelligent Systems
National Science Foundation
4201 Wilson Boulevard
Arlington, VA 22230

WTEC PANEL AND OTHER CONTRIBUTORS

George Whitesides, PhD
(Chair)
Harvard University
12 Oxford St.
Cambridge, MA 02138

Bruce Tonn, PhD
(Co-chair)
University of Tennessee, Knoxville
McClung Tower, Room 1018
Knoxville, TN 37996

Mamadou Diallo, PhD
California Institute of Technology
(USA) and KAIST (Korea)
1200 East California Blvd.
Mail Stop 139-74,
Pasadena, CA 91125

Mark Lundstrom, PhD
Purdue University
School of Electrical and Computer Engineering
465 Northwestern Ave.
Suite 207 S
West Lafayette, IN 47907

James Olds, PhD
George Mason University
Krasnow Institute for Advanced Studies
4400 University Dr.
Mail Stop 2A1
Fairfax, VA 22030

Robert Urban, PhD
Johnson & Johnson Boston Innovation Center
One Broadway
14th Floor
Cambridge, MA 02142

H.S. Philip Wong, PhD
Stanford University
Paul G. Allen Building 312X
420 Via Palou
Stanford, CA 94305

Piotr Grodzinski, PhD
National Cancer Institute
Building 31, Room 10A52
31 Center Drive, MSC 2580
Bethesda, MD 20892

Barbara Harthorn, PhD
Center for Nanotechnology in Society
University of California Santa Barbara
Santa Barbara, CA 93106

Todd Kuiken, PhD
Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars
One Woodrow Wilson Plaza
1300 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.
Washington, DC 20004

Robert Langer, PhD
MIT
Langer Lab
77 Massachusetts Ave.
Room 76-661
Cambridge, MA 02139

David Rejeski, PhD
Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars
One Woodrow Wilson Plaza
1300 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20004

R. Stanley Williams, PhD
Hewlett-Packard Laboratories
Memristor Research Group
1501 Page Mill Rd.
Palo Alto, CA 94304
EXTERNAL REVIEWERS FOR THE WRITTEN REPORT

Toshio Baba, PhD, Science and Technology Agency, Japan
Gerd Bachmann, PhD, VDI Technology Center, Germany
Robbie Barbero, PhD, Office of Science and Technology Policy (OSTP), Executive Office of the President, U.S.
Dawn Bonnell, PhD, Nano/Bio Interface Center, University of Pennsylvania, U.S.
David Guston, PhD, Consortium for Science, Policy and Outcomes, Arizona State University, U.S.
Tony Hey, PhD, Microsoft Corporation, U.S.
Bruce Kramer, PhD, National Science Foundation, U.S.
Neal Lane, PhD, James A. Baker III Institute for Public Policy, Rice University, U.S.
Jo-Won Lee, PhD, Hanyang University, Korea
Stuart Lindsay, PhD, Biodesign Institute, Arizona State University, U.S.
Mira Marcus-Kalish, PhD, Tel Aviv University, Israel
J. Tinsley Oden, PhD, Institute for Computational Engineering & Sciences, The University of Texas at Austin, U.S.
Robert Pohanka, PhD, National Nanotechnology Coordination Office, OSTP, U.S.
Françoise Roure, PhD, OECD and High Council for Industry, Energy and Technologies, France
George Strawn, PhD, National Coordinating Office for Networking and Information Technology Research and Development, OSTP, U.S.
Thomas Theis, PhD, IBM Corporation and Semiconductor Research Corporation, U.S.
James J. Valdes, PhD, U.S. Army

WORLD TECHNOLOGY EVALUATION CENTER, INC. (WTEC)

R. D. Shelton, President
Patricia Foland, Vice President for International Operations, Project Manager
Geoffrey M. Holdridge, Vice President for Government Services
Patricia M. H. Johnson, Copy Editor
Matthew Henderson, Assistant Project Manager
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We at WTEC wish to thank all of the participants for their valuable insights and their dedicated work in conducting this international study of the transforming tools of emerging and converging technologies for societal benefit. Appendix B has a complete list of the many experts around the world who shared their valuable time with us. Here I have only the space to recognize a few people. The contributors who took the lead in writing these chapters deserve special mention. They include William Bainbridge, Jian Cao, Mamadou Diallo, Mark Lundstrom, James Olds, Mike Roco, Bruce Tonn, Robert Urban, George Whitesides, and Philip Wong.

For making this study possible, our sincere thanks go to those who helped arrange research funding, including many at NSF in the Directorates of Engineering (Kesh Narayanan), Computer and Information Science and Engineering (Sankar Basu), Biological Sciences (Chuck Liarakos), Mathematical & Physical Sciences (Celeste Rohlfing) and Social, Behavioral & Economic Sciences (Frederick Kronz). Nora Savage at EPA, Michael Meador at NASA, Lawrence Kabacoff at the Office of Naval Research, Piotr Grodzinski and Larry Nagahara at the NIH National Cancer Institute, and Hondga Chen of the U.S. Department of Agriculture also contributed. David Rejeski at the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars created video interviews with leading experts on convergence. Our international hosts supported the costs of the workshops abroad and provided unparalleled hospitality. Among others, they included Esper Abrão Cavalheiro of the University of Sao Paulo (Brazil), Christos Tokamanis of the European Commission (EU), Gilbert Declerck of IMEC (Belgium), Chang Woo Kim of the National Nanotechnology Policy Center and Jo-Won Lee of Hanyang University (Korea), Kazunobu Tanaka of Japan Science and Technology Agency (Japan), Chunli Bai of the Chinese Academy of Sciences and Chen Wang of the National Center for Nanoscience and Technology (China), and Chennupati Jagadish of Australia National University (Australia).

And, of course, Mike Roco provided the guiding light for the whole effort, very much engaged in coordination, writing, and editing, and in pushing everyone along to get the best possible results.

R. D. Shelton
President, WTEC

WTEC MISSION

WTEC provides assessments of international research and development in selected technologies under awards from the National Science Foundation (NSF), the Office of Naval Research (ONR), and other agencies. Formerly part of Loyola College, WTEC is now a separate nonprofit research institute. Kesh Narayanan, Deputy Assistant Director for Engineering, is NSF Program Director for WTEC. WTEC's mission is to inform U.S. scientists, engineers, and policymakers of global trends in science and technology. WTEC assessments cover basic research, advanced development, and applications. Panelists are leading authorities in their field, technically active, and knowledgeable about U.S. and foreign research programs. As part of the assessment process, these peer review panels visit and carry out discussions with foreign scientists and engineers abroad. The WTEC staff helps select topics, recruits expert panelists, arranges study visits to foreign laboratories, organizes workshop presentations, and finally, edits, and publishes the final reports. See http://wtec.org for more information, or contact R. D. Shelton, shelton@wtec.org.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Study Team and Report Authors........................................................................................................ ii
External Reviewers for the Written Report........................................................................................ iii
Acknowledgements........................................................................................................................... iv
Table of Contents............................................................................................................................ v

**Executive Summary** ....................................................................................................................... 1

**Overview and Recommendations** ................................................................................................. 7

1. **Convergence Platforms: Foundational Science and Technology Tools** ........................................ 33
   1.1 Vision........................................................................................................................................... 34
   1.2 Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status........................................................................ 35
   1.3 Goals for the Next Decade.......................................................................................................... 38
   1.4 Infrastructure Needs.................................................................................................................... 46
   1.5 R&D Strategies............................................................................................................................ 50
   1.6 Conclusions and Priorities........................................................................................................... 50
   1.7 R&D Impact on Society............................................................................................................... 50
   1.8 Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts.................................................. 51
   1.9 International Perspectives.......................................................................................................... 65
   1.10 References................................................................................................................................. 68

2. **Convergence Platforms: Human-Scale Convergence and the Quality of Life** ............................ 72
   2.1 Vision........................................................................................................................................... 73
   2.2 Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status........................................................................ 75
   2.3 Goals for the Next Decade.......................................................................................................... 77
   2.4 Infrastructure Needs.................................................................................................................... 81
   2.5 R&D Strategies............................................................................................................................ 82
   2.6 Conclusions and Priorities........................................................................................................... 85
   2.7 R&D Impact on Society............................................................................................................... 87
   2.8 Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts.................................................. 89
   2.9 International Perspectives.......................................................................................................... 97
   2.10 References................................................................................................................................. 99

3. **Convergence Platforms: Earth-Scale Systems** ........................................................................... 103
   3.1 Vision........................................................................................................................................... 105
   3.2 Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status........................................................................ 108
   3.3 Goals for the Next Decade.......................................................................................................... 112
   3.4 Infrastructure Needs.................................................................................................................... 113
   3.5 R&D Strategies............................................................................................................................ 113
   3.6 Conclusions and Priorities........................................................................................................... 114
   3.7 R&D Impact on Society............................................................................................................... 117
   3.8 Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts.................................................. 117
# Table of Contents

3.9 International Perspectives ................................................................................ 128
3.10 References ........................................................................................................ 133

4. **Methods to Improve and Expedite Convergence** ........................................ 136
   Defining Convergence ....................................................................................... 136
   4.1 Vision .............................................................................................................. 138
   4.2 Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status ........................................ 141
   4.3 Goals for the Next Decade ........................................................................... 144
   4.4 Infrastructure Needs ...................................................................................... 151
   4.5 R&D Strategies .............................................................................................. 152
   4.6 Conclusions and Priorities ............................................................................ 153
   4.7 R&D Impact on Society ................................................................................ 154
   4.8 Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts .................... 155
   4.9 International Perspectives ............................................................................ 164
   4.10 References .................................................................................................... 168

5. **Implications: Human Health and Physical Potential** .................................... 171
   5.1 Vision .............................................................................................................. 171
   5.2 Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status ........................................ 172
   5.3 Goals for the Next Decade ............................................................................ 174
   5.4 Infrastructure Needs ...................................................................................... 183
   5.5 R&D Strategies .............................................................................................. 184
   5.6 Conclusions and Priorities ............................................................................ 188
   5.7 R&D Impact on Society ................................................................................ 188
   5.8 Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts .................... 189
   5.9 International Perspectives ............................................................................ 192
   5.10 References .................................................................................................... 198

6. **Implications: Human Cognition and Communication and the Emergence of the Cognitive Society** ......................................................... 201
   6.1 Vision .............................................................................................................. 201
   6.2 Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status ........................................ 203
   6.3 Goals for the Next Decade ............................................................................ 206
   6.4 Infrastructure Needs ...................................................................................... 211
   6.5 R&D Strategies .............................................................................................. 211
   6.6 Conclusions and Priorities ............................................................................ 212
   6.7 R&D Impact on Society ................................................................................ 213
   6.8 Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts .................... 214
   6.9 International Perspectives ............................................................................ 219
   6.10 References .................................................................................................... 222

7. **Implications: Societal Collective Outcomes, including Manufacturing** ........ 225
   7.1 Vision .............................................................................................................. 225
   7.2 Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status ........................................ 227
# Table of Contents

7.3 Goals for the Next Decade ....................................................................................... 233
7.4 Infrastructure Needs ............................................................................................... 236
7.5 R&D Strategies ......................................................................................................... 236
7.6 Conclusions and Priorities ........................................................................................... 237
7.7 R&D Impact on Society ............................................................................................... 237
7.8 Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts ..................................... 238
7.9 International Perspectives ............................................................................................. 243
7.10 References .................................................................................................................. 246

8. Implications: People and Physical Infrastructure .......................................................... 249
8.1 Vision ............................................................................................................................... 250
8.2 Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status ........................................................ 256
8.3 Goals for the Next Decade ............................................................................................. 267
8.4 Infrastructure Needs ....................................................................................................... 270
8.5 R&D Strategies ............................................................................................................. 270
8.6 Conclusions and Priorities ............................................................................................. 275
8.7 R&D Impact on Society ................................................................................................. 276
8.8 Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts ..................................... 277
8.9 International Perspectives ............................................................................................. 303
8.10 References ................................................................................................................... 306
8.11 Recommended General Reading .................................................................................. 310

9. Implications: Convergence of Knowledge and Technology for a Sustainable Society ...... 311
9.1 Vision ............................................................................................................................... 311
9.2 Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status ........................................................ 313
9.3 Goals for the Next Decade ............................................................................................. 327
9.4 Infrastructure Needs ....................................................................................................... 331
9.5 R&D Strategies ............................................................................................................. 332
9.6 Conclusions and Priorities ............................................................................................. 332
9.7 R&D Impact on Society ................................................................................................. 333
9.8 Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts ..................................... 333
9.9 International Perspectives ............................................................................................. 348
9.10 References ................................................................................................................... 352

10. Innovative and Responsible Governance of Converging Technologies ....................... 357
10.1 Vision ............................................................................................................................... 357
10.2 Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status ........................................................ 359
10.3 Goals for the Next Decade ............................................................................................. 366
10.4 Infrastructure Needs ....................................................................................................... 370
10.5 R&D Strategies ............................................................................................................. 371
10.6 Conclusions and Priorities ............................................................................................. 371
10.7 R&D Impact on Society ................................................................................................. 373
10.8 Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts ..................................... 374
10.9 International Perspectives .............................................................................................. 393
10.10 References ...................................................................................................................... 395

Appendixes
A. List of U.S. and International Workshops ................................................................. 401
B. List of Participants and Contributors .......................................................................... 403
C. Abstract of the Converging Technologies Workshop in São Paulo, Brazil, November 2011. 411
D. Review of NBIC Visionary Goals put forward after 2001 ........................................ 412
E. Selected Reports and Books about Convergence .......................................................... 421
F. The Wilson Center Video Interviews: “Leading Scientists Discuss Converging Technologies” ...428
G. Glossary of Selected Terms and Concepts .................................................................... 429
H. List of Acronyms .............................................................................................................. 435