



WTEC Panel Report on

# CONVERGENCE OF KNOWLEDGE, TECHNOLOGY, AND SOCIETY: *Beyond Convergence of Nano-Bio-Info-Cognitive Technologies*

July 2013

*Editors*

**Mihail C. Roco**

**William S. Bainbridge**

**Bruce Tonn**

**George Whitesides**



World Technology Evaluation Center, Inc.  
448 Murray Hill Circle, Ste #120  
Lancaster, PA 17601



**Citation:** M.C. Roco, W.S. Bainbridge, B. Tonn, and G. Whitesides, eds. 2013. *Converging knowledge, technology, and society: Beyond convergence of nano-bio-info-cognitive technologies*. Dordrecht, Heidelberg, New York, London: Springer. (The WTEC report is available on the website <http://www.wtec.org/NBIC2>; the convergence interviews are available on the website <http://www.wilsoncenter.org/convergence>.)

**Cover page:** Using the image of a conductor, the CTKS logo on the cover page suggests coordination through societal governance of the essential knowledge and technology platforms (foundational tools, human-scale and Earth-scale platforms) to realize a vision of their convergence to benefit society (people living on the Earth).

**The U.S. Federal agencies that sponsored the study** are the National Science Foundation (NSF), National Institutes of Health (NIH), National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA), Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Office of Naval Research (ONR), and United States Department of Agriculture (USDA).

**Copyright 2013 by WTEC.** The U.S. Government retains a nonexclusive and nontransferable license to exercise all exclusive rights provided by copyright. This document is sponsored by the National Science Foundation (NSF) under a cooperative agreement from NSF (ENG-0844639) to the World Technology Evaluation Center, Inc. The first and second co-editors were supported by the NSF Directorate for Engineering and Directorate for Computer and Information Science and Engineering, respectively. The Government has certain rights in this material. Any writings, opinions, findings, and conclusions expressed in this material are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Government, the authors' parent institutions, or WTEC. This document is available at <http://www.wtec.org/NBIC2>. Selected interviews with experts on convergence are posted at <http://www.wilsoncenter.org/convergence>. A list of available WTEC reports is on the inside back cover of this report.

*WTEC Study on*

**CONVERGENCE OF KNOWLEDGE, TECHNOLOGY, AND SOCIETY:**

*Beyond Convergence of Nano-Bio-Info-Cognitive Technologies*

**July 2013**

*Editors*

Mihail C. Roco  
William S. Bainbridge  
Bruce Tonn  
George Whitesides

**WTEC Study on Convergence of Knowledge, Technology, and Society:  
*Beyond Convergence of Nano-Bio-Info-Cognitive Technologies***

**STUDY TEAM AND REPORT AUTHORS**

**STUDY COORDINATORS**

**Mihail C. Roco, PhD**

Senior Advisor for Nanotechnology  
National Science Foundation  
4201 Wilson Boulevard  
Arlington, VA 22230

**William S. Bainbridge, PhD**

Division of Information and Intelligent Systems  
National Science Foundation  
4201 Wilson Boulevard  
Arlington, VA 22230

**WTEC PANEL AND OTHER CONTRIBUTORS**

**George Whitesides, PhD  
(Chair)**

Harvard University  
12 Oxford St.  
Cambridge, MA 02138

**Bruce Tonn, PhD  
(Co-chair)**

University of Tennessee, Knoxville  
McClung Tower, Room 1018  
Knoxville, TN 37996

**Jian Cao, PhD**

Northwestern University  
Dept. of Mechanical Engineering  
2145 Sheridan Rd.  
Evanston, IL 60208

**Mamadou Diallo, PhD**

California Institute of Technology  
(USA) and KAIST (Korea)  
1200 East California Blvd.  
Mail Stop 139-74,  
Pasadena, CA 91125

**Mark Lundstrom, PhD**

Purdue University  
School of Electrical and Computer  
Engineering  
465 Northwestern Ave.  
Suite 207 S  
West Lafayette, IN 47907

**James Murday, PhD**

USC Office of Research  
Advancement  
701 Pennsylvania Ave. NW  
Suite 540  
Washington DC 20004

**James Olds, PhD**

George Mason University  
Krasnow Institute for Advanced  
Studies  
4400 University Dr.  
Mail Stop 2A1  
Fairfax, VA 22030

**Robert Urban, PhD**

Johnson & Johnson Boston  
Innovation Center  
One Broadway  
14th Floor  
Cambridge, MA 02142

**H.S. Philip Wong, PhD**

Stanford University  
Paul G. Allen Building 312X  
420 Via Palou  
Stanford, CA 94305

**Piotr Grodzinski, PhD**

National Cancer Institute  
Building 31, Room 10A52  
31 Center Drive, MSC 2580  
Bethesda, MD 20892

**Barbara Harthorn, PhD**

Center for Nanotechnology in  
Society  
University of California Santa  
Barbara  
Santa Barbara, CA 93106

**Todd Kuiken, PhD**

Woodrow Wilson International  
Center for Scholars  
One Woodrow Wilson Plaza  
1300 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.  
Washington, DC 20004

**Robert Langer, PhD**

MIT  
Langer Lab  
77 Massachusetts Ave.  
Room 76-661  
Cambridge, MA 02139

**David Rejeski, PhD**

Woodrow Wilson International  
Center for Scholars  
One Woodrow Wilson Plaza  
1300 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20004

**R. Stanley Williams, PhD**

Hewlett-Packard Laboratories  
Memristor Research Group  
1501 Page Mill Rd.  
Palo Alto, CA 94304

## EXTERNAL REVIEWERS FOR THE WRITTEN REPORT

**Toshio Baba, PhD**, Science and Technology Agency, Japan

**Gerd Bachmann, PhD**, VDI Technology Center, Germany

**Robbie Barbero, PhD**, Office of Science and Technology Policy (OSTP), Executive Office of the President, U.S.

**Dawn Bonnell, PhD**, Nano/Bio Interface Center, University of Pennsylvania, U.S.

**David Guston, PhD**, Consortium for Science, Policy and Outcomes, Arizona State University, U.S.

**Tony Hey, PhD**, Microsoft Corporation, U.S.

**Bruce Kramer, PhD**, National Science Foundation, U.S.

**Neal Lane, PhD**, James A. Baker III Institute for Public Policy, Rice University, U.S.

**Jo-Won Lee, PhD**, Hanyang University, Korea

**Stuart Lindsay, PhD**, Biodesign Institute, Arizona State University, U.S.

**Mira Marcus-Kalish, PhD**, Tel Aviv University, Israel

**J. Tinsley Oden, PhD**, Institute for Computational Engineering & Sciences, The University of Texas at Austin, U.S.

**Robert Pohanka, PhD**, National Nanotechnology Coordination Office, OSTP, U.S.

**Françoise Roure, PhD**, OECD and High Council for Industry, Energy and Technologies, France

**George Strawn, PhD**, National Coordinating Office for Networking and Information Technology Research and Development, OSTP, U.S.

**Thomas Theis, PhD**, IBM Corporation and Semiconductor Research Corporation, U.S.

**James J. Valdes, PhD**, U.S. Army

## WORLD TECHNOLOGY EVALUATION CENTER, INC. (WTEC)

**R. D. Shelton**, President

**Patricia Foland**, Vice President for International Operations, Project Manager

**Geoffrey M. Holdridge**, Vice President for Government Services

**Patricia M. H. Johnson**, Copy Editor

**Matthew Henderson**, Assistant Project Manager

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We at WTEC wish to thank all of the participants for their valuable insights and their dedicated work in conducting this international study of the transforming tools of emerging and converging technologies for societal benefit. Appendix B has a complete list of the many experts around the world who shared their valuable time with us. Here I have only the space to recognize a few people. The contributors who took the lead in writing these chapters deserve special mention. They include William Bainbridge, Jian Cao, Mamadou Diallo, Mark Lundstrom, James Olds, Mike Roco, Bruce Tonn, Robert Urban, George Whitesides, and Philip Wong.

For making this study possible, our sincere thanks go to those who helped arrange research funding, including many at NSF in the Directorates of Engineering (Kesh Narayanan), Computer and Information Science and Engineering (Sankar Basu), Biological Sciences (Chuck Liarakos), Mathematical & Physical Sciences (Celeste Rohlfing) and Social, Behavioral & Economic Sciences (Frederick Kronz). Nora Savage at EPA, Michael Meador at NASA, Lawrence Kabacoff at the Office of Naval Research, Piotr Grodzinski and Larry Nagahara at the NIH National Cancer Institute, and Hondga Chen of the U.S. Department of Agriculture also contributed. David Rejeski at the Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars created video interviews with leading experts on convergence. Our international hosts supported the costs of the workshops abroad and provided unparalleled hospitality. Among others, they included Esper Abrão Cavalheiro of the University of Sao Paulo (Brazil), Christos Tokamanis of the European Commission (EU), Gilbert Declerck of IMEC (Belgium), Chang Woo Kim of the National Nanotechnology Policy Center and Jo-Won Lee of Hanyang University (Korea), Kazunobu Tanaka of Japan Science and Technology Agency (Japan), Chunli Bai of the Chinese Academy of Sciences and Chen Wang of the National Center for Nanoscience and Technology (China), and Chennupati Jagadish of Australia National University (Australia).

And, of course, Mike Roco provided the guiding light for the whole effort, very much engaged in coordination, writing, and editing, and in pushing everyone along to get the best possible results.

R. D. Shelton

President, WTEC

### WTEC MISSION

WTEC provides assessments of international research and development in selected technologies under awards from the National Science Foundation (NSF), the Office of Naval Research (ONR), and other agencies. Formerly part of Loyola College, WTEC is now a separate nonprofit research institute. Kesh Narayanan, Deputy Assistant Director for Engineering, is NSF Program Director for WTEC. WTEC's mission is to inform U.S. scientists, engineers, and policymakers of global trends in science and technology. WTEC assessments cover basic research, advanced development, and applications. Panelists are leading authorities in their field, technically active, and knowledgeable about U.S. and foreign research programs. As part of the assessment process, these peer review panels visit and carry out discussions with foreign scientists and engineers abroad. The WTEC staff helps select topics, recruits expert panelists, arranges study visits to foreign laboratories, organizes workshop presentations, and finally, edits, and publishes the final reports. See <http://wtec.org> for more information, or contact R. D. Shelton, [shelton@wtec.org](mailto:shelton@wtec.org).

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Study Team and Report Authors.....	ii
External Reviewers for the Written Report.....	iii
Acknowledgements.....	iv
Table of Contents.....	v
<b>Executive Summary</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>Overview and Recommendations</b> .....	<b>7</b>
<b>1. Convergence Platforms: Foundational Science and Technology Tools</b> .....	<b>33</b>
1.1 Vision.....	34
1.2 Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status.....	35
1.3 Goals for the Next Decade.....	38
1.4 Infrastructure Needs.....	46
1.5 R&D Strategies.....	50
1.6 Conclusions and Priorities.....	50
1.7 R&D Impact on Society.....	50
1.8 Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts.....	51
1.9 International Perspectives.....	65
1.10 References.....	68
<b>2. Convergence Platforms: Human-Scale Convergence and the Quality of Life</b> .....	<b>72</b>
2.1 Vision.....	73
2.2 Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status.....	75
2.3 Goals for the Next Decade.....	77
2.4 Infrastructure Needs.....	81
2.5 R&D Strategies.....	82
2.6 Conclusions and Priorities.....	85
2.7 R&D Impact on Society.....	87
2.8 Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts.....	89
2.9 International Perspectives.....	97
2.10 References.....	99
<b>3. Convergence Platforms: Earth-Scale Systems</b> .....	<b>103</b>
3.1 Vision.....	105
3.2 Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status.....	108
3.3 Goals for the Next Decade.....	112
3.4 Infrastructure Needs.....	113
3.5 R&D Strategies.....	113
3.6 Conclusions and Priorities.....	114
3.7 R&D Impact on Society.....	117
3.8 Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts.....	117

3.9	International Perspectives .....	128
3.10	References.....	133
<b>4.</b>	<b>Methods to Improve and Expedite Convergence .....</b>	<b>136</b>
	Defining Convergence .....	136
4.1	Vision.....	138
4.2	Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status .....	141
4.3	Goals for the Next Decade.....	144
4.4	Infrastructure Needs.....	151
4.5	R&D Strategies .....	152
4.6	Conclusions and Priorities .....	153
4.7	R&D Impact on Society.....	154
4.8	Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts .....	155
4.9	International Perspectives .....	164
4.10	References.....	168
<b>5.</b>	<b>Implications: Human Health and Physical Potential .....</b>	<b>171</b>
5.1	Vision.....	171
5.2	Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status .....	172
5.3	Goals for the Next Decade.....	174
5.4	Infrastructure Needs.....	183
5.5	R&D Strategies .....	184
5.6	Conclusions and Priorities .....	188
5.7	R&D Impact on Society.....	188
5.8	Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts .....	189
5.9	International Perspectives .....	192
5.10	References.....	198
<b>6.</b>	<b>Implications: Human Cognition and Communication and the Emergence of the Cognitive Society .....</b>	<b>201</b>
6.1	Vision.....	201
6.2	Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status .....	203
6.3	Goals for the Next Decade.....	206
6.4	Infrastructure Needs.....	211
6.5	R&D Strategies .....	211
6.6	Conclusions and Priorities .....	212
6.7	R&D Impact on Society.....	213
6.8	Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts .....	214
6.9	International Perspectives .....	219
6.10	References.....	222
<b>7.</b>	<b>Implications: Societal Collective Outcomes, including Manufacturing.....</b>	<b>225</b>
7.1	Vision.....	225
7.2	Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status .....	227



7.3	Goals for the Next Decade.....	233
7.4	Infrastructure Needs.....	236
7.5	R&D Strategies.....	236
7.6	Conclusions and Priorities .....	237
7.7	R&D Impact on Society.....	237
7.8	Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts .....	238
7.9	International Perspectives .....	243
7.10	References.....	246
<b>8.</b>	<b>Implications: People and Physical Infrastructure .....</b>	<b>249</b>
8.1	Vision.....	250
8.2	Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status .....	256
8.3	Goals for the Next Decade.....	267
8.4	Infrastructure Needs.....	270
8.5	R&D Strategies.....	270
8.6	Conclusions and Priorities .....	275
8.7	R&D Impact on Society.....	276
8.8	Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts .....	277
8.9	International Perspectives .....	303
8.10	References.....	306
8.11	Recommended General Reading .....	310
<b>9.</b>	<b>Implications: Convergence of Knowledge and Technology for a Sustainable Society .....</b>	<b>311</b>
9.1	Vision.....	311
9.2	Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status .....	313
9.3	Goals for the Next Decade.....	327
9.4	Infrastructure Needs.....	331
9.5	R&D Strategies.....	332
9.6	Conclusions and Priorities .....	332
9.7	R&D Impact on Society.....	333
9.8	Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts .....	333
9.9	International Perspectives .....	348
9.10	References.....	352
<b>10.</b>	<b>Innovative and Responsible Governance of Converging Technologies .....</b>	<b>357</b>
10.1	Vision.....	357
10.2	Advances in the Last Decade and Current Status .....	359
10.3	Goals for the Next Decade.....	366
10.4	Infrastructure Needs.....	370
10.5	R&D Strategies.....	371
10.6	Conclusions and Priorities .....	371
10.7	R&D Impact on Society.....	373
10.8	Examples of Achievements and Convergence Paradigm Shifts .....	374

10.9 International Perspectives .....	393
10.10 References .....	395
<b>Appendixes</b>	
A. List of U.S. and International Workshops .....	401
B. List of Participants and Contributors .....	403
C. Abstract of the Converging Technologies Workshop in São Paulo, Brazil, November 2011 .	411
D. Review of NBIC Visionary Goals put forward after 2001 .....	412
E. Selected Reports and Books about Convergence.....	421
F. The Wilson Center Video Interviews: “Leading Scientists Discuss Converging Technologies” ...	428
G. Glossary of Selected Terms and Concepts.....	429
H. List of Acronyms .....	435